

# ANALYSIS -I

B V Rajarama Bhat

Indian Statistical Institute, Bangalore

## Lecture 20. Limit Superior and Limit Inferior

- We recall the following important theorem:

## Lecture 20. Limit Superior and Limit Inferior

- ▶ We recall the following important theorem:
- ▶ Theorem 18.10 (Bolzano-Weierstrass theorem): Every bounded sequence of real numbers has a convergent subsequence.

## Lecture 20. Limit Superior and Limit Inferior

- ▶ We recall the following important theorem:
- ▶ Theorem 18.10 (Bolzano-Weierstrass theorem): Every bounded sequence of real numbers has a convergent subsequence.
- ▶ Proof. Let  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a bounded sequence of real numbers.

## Lecture 20. Limit Superior and Limit Inferior

- ▶ We recall the following important theorem:
- ▶ **Theorem 18.10 (Bolzano-Weierstrass theorem):** Every bounded sequence of real numbers has a convergent subsequence.
- ▶ **Proof.** Let  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a bounded sequence of real numbers.
- ▶ By previous theorem there exists a monotonic subsequence of  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ .

## Lecture 20. Limit Superior and Limit Inferior

- ▶ We recall the following important theorem:
- ▶ **Theorem 18.10 (Bolzano-Weierstrass theorem):** Every bounded sequence of real numbers has a convergent subsequence.
- ▶ **Proof.** Let  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a bounded sequence of real numbers.
- ▶ By previous theorem there exists a monotonic subsequence of  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ .
- ▶ Obviously, this monotonic subsequence is bounded as the original sequence is bounded.

## Lecture 20. Limit Superior and Limit Inferior

- ▶ We recall the following important theorem:
- ▶ **Theorem 18.10 (Bolzano-Weierstrass theorem):** Every bounded sequence of real numbers has a convergent subsequence.
- ▶ **Proof.** Let  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a bounded sequence of real numbers.
- ▶ By previous theorem there exists a monotonic subsequence of  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ .
- ▶ Obviously, this monotonic subsequence is bounded as the original sequence is bounded.
- ▶ As every bounded monotonic sequence is convergent, this subsequence is convergent. This completes the proof.

## Limit points

- ▶ We also recall the notion of limit points:

# Limit points

- ▶ We also recall the notion of limit points:
- ▶ **Definition 18.5:** Let  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a sequence of real numbers. Then  $y \in \mathbb{R}$  is said to be **limit point** of  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ , if it has a subsequence  $\{a_{n_k}\}_{k \in \mathbb{N}}$  converging to  $y$ .
- ▶ We would like to understand the structure of limit points better. The following theorem is easy to prove.

## Terms around a limit point

► **Theorem 20.1:** Let  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a sequence of real numbers. Then  $y \in \mathbb{R}$  is a limit point of the sequence  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  if and only if the set

$$\{m : a_m \in (y - \epsilon, y + \epsilon)\}$$

is infinite for every  $\epsilon > 0$ .

## Terms around a limit point

- **Theorem 20.1:** Let  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a sequence of real numbers. Then  $y \in \mathbb{R}$  is a limit point of the sequence  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  if and only if the set

$$\{m : a_m \in (y - \epsilon, y + \epsilon)\}$$

is infinite for every  $\epsilon > 0$ .

- In other words, there are infinitely many terms of the sequence in  $(y - \epsilon, y + \epsilon)$  for every  $\epsilon > 0$ .
- **Proof:** Suppose for  $k \in \mathbb{N}$ ,

$$\{m : a_m \in (y - \frac{1}{k}, y + \frac{1}{k})\}$$

is infinite for every  $k$ . Then it is easy to choose a subsequence  $\{a_{n_k}\}_{k \in \mathbb{N}}$  such that

$$y - \frac{1}{k} \leq a_{n_k} \leq y + \frac{1}{k}.$$

## Terms around a limit point

- **Theorem 20.1:** Let  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a sequence of real numbers. Then  $y \in \mathbb{R}$  is a limit point of the sequence  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  if and only if the set

$$\{m : a_m \in (y - \epsilon, y + \epsilon)\}$$

is infinite for every  $\epsilon > 0$ .

- In other words, there are infinitely many terms of the sequence in  $(y - \epsilon, y + \epsilon)$  for every  $\epsilon > 0$ .
- **Proof:** Suppose for  $k \in \mathbb{N}$ ,

$$\{m : a_m \in (y - \frac{1}{k}, y + \frac{1}{k})\}$$

is infinite for every  $k$ . Then it is easy to choose a subsequence  $\{a_{n_k}\}_{k \in \mathbb{N}}$  such that

$$y - \frac{1}{k} \leq a_{n_k} \leq y + \frac{1}{k}.$$

- By the squeeze theorem,  $\lim_{k \rightarrow \infty} a_{n_k} = y$ .

## Terms around a limit point

- **Theorem 20.1:** Let  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a sequence of real numbers. Then  $y \in \mathbb{R}$  is a limit point of the sequence  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  if and only if the set

$$\{m : a_m \in (y - \epsilon, y + \epsilon)\}$$

is infinite for every  $\epsilon > 0$ .

- In other words, there are infinitely many terms of the sequence in  $(y - \epsilon, y + \epsilon)$  for every  $\epsilon > 0$ .
- **Proof:** Suppose for  $k \in \mathbb{N}$ ,

$$\{m : a_m \in (y - \frac{1}{k}, y + \frac{1}{k})\}$$

is infinite for every  $k$ . Then it is easy to choose a subsequence  $\{a_{n_k}\}_{k \in \mathbb{N}}$  such that

$$y - \frac{1}{k} \leq a_{n_k} \leq y + \frac{1}{k}.$$

- By the squeeze theorem,  $\lim_{k \rightarrow \infty} a_{n_k} = y$ .
- The converse is also easy to see.

## Limsup

- ▶ Let  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a bounded sequence of real numbers and suppose  $|a_n| \leq M$ , for all  $n$ .

## Limsup

- ▶ Let  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a bounded sequence of real numbers and suppose  $|a_n| \leq M$ , for all  $n$ .
- ▶ Take  $b_1 = \sup\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}\} = \sup\{a_1, a_2, \dots\}$ ;

## Limsup

- ▶ Let  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a bounded sequence of real numbers and suppose  $|a_n| \leq M$ , for all  $n$ .
- ▶ Take  $b_1 = \sup\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}\} = \sup\{a_1, a_2, \dots\}$ ;
- ▶  $b_2 = \sup\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq 2\} = \sup\{a_2, a_3, \dots\}$ ;
- ▶  $b_3 = \sup\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq 3\} = \sup\{a_3, a_4, \dots\}$ ;

## Limsup

- ▶ Let  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a bounded sequence of real numbers and suppose  $|a_n| \leq M$ , for all  $n$ .
- ▶ Take  $b_1 = \sup\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}\} = \sup\{a_1, a_2, \dots\}$ ;
- ▶  $b_2 = \sup\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq 2\} = \sup\{a_2, a_3, \dots\}$ ;
- ▶  $b_3 = \sup\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq 3\} = \sup\{a_3, a_4, \dots\}$ ;
- ▶ and for any  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ ,

$$b_n = \sup\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq n\} = \sup\{a_n, a_{n+1}, \dots\}.$$

## Limsup

- ▶ Let  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a bounded sequence of real numbers and suppose  $|a_n| \leq M$ , for all  $n$ .
- ▶ Take  $b_1 = \sup\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}\} = \sup\{a_1, a_2, \dots\}$ ;
- ▶  $b_2 = \sup\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq 2\} = \sup\{a_2, a_3, \dots\}$ ;
- ▶  $b_3 = \sup\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq 3\} = \sup\{a_3, a_4, \dots\}$ ;
- ▶ and for any  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ ,

$$b_n = \sup\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq n\} = \sup\{a_n, a_{n+1}, \dots\}.$$

- ▶ Note that as  $\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}\} \supseteq \{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq 2\}$ , we have  $b_1 \geq b_2$ .

## Limsup

- ▶ Let  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a bounded sequence of real numbers and suppose  $|a_n| \leq M$ , for all  $n$ .
- ▶ Take  $b_1 = \sup\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}\} = \sup\{a_1, a_2, \dots\}$ ;
- ▶  $b_2 = \sup\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq 2\} = \sup\{a_2, a_3, \dots\}$ ;
- ▶  $b_3 = \sup\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq 3\} = \sup\{a_3, a_4, \dots\}$ ;
- ▶ and for any  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ ,

$$b_n = \sup\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq n\} = \sup\{a_n, a_{n+1}, \dots\}.$$

- ▶ Note that as  $\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}\} \supseteq \{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq 2\}$ , we have  $b_1 \geq b_2$ .
- ▶ In general,  $b_n \geq b_{n+1}$  for every  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ . We also have  $|b_n| \leq M$  for every  $n$ , as  $|a_m| \leq M$  for every  $m$ .

## Limsup

- ▶ Let  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a bounded sequence of real numbers and suppose  $|a_n| \leq M$ , for all  $n$ .
- ▶ Take  $b_1 = \sup\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}\} = \sup\{a_1, a_2, \dots\}$ ;
- ▶  $b_2 = \sup\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq 2\} = \sup\{a_2, a_3, \dots\}$ ;
- ▶  $b_3 = \sup\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq 3\} = \sup\{a_3, a_4, \dots\}$ ;
- ▶ and for any  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ ,

$$b_n = \sup\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq n\} = \sup\{a_n, a_{n+1}, \dots\}.$$

- ▶ Note that as  $\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}\} \supseteq \{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq 2\}$ , we have  $b_1 \geq b_2$ .
- ▶ In general,  $b_n \geq b_{n+1}$  for every  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ . We also have  $|b_n| \leq M$  for every  $n$ , as  $|a_m| \leq M$  for every  $m$ .
- ▶ In conclusion,  $\{b_n\}$  is a bounded decreasing sequence. Hence  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} b_n$  exists.

## Continuation

- ▶ **Definition 20.2:** For any bounded sequence  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ , the  $\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} b_n$  defined as above is known as the **limit superior** or **limsup** of the bounded sequence  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ , and we write:

$$\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} b_n.$$

## Continuation

- ▶ **Definition 20.2:** For any bounded sequence  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ , the  $\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} b_n$  defined as above is known as the **limit superior** or **limsup** of the bounded sequence  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ , and we write:

$$\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} b_n.$$

- ▶ In other words, the 'limsup' is the limit of supremums of tails of the sequence.

## Liminf

- ▶ Let  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a bounded sequence of real numbers and suppose  $|a_n| \leq M$ , for all  $n$ .

## Liminf

- ▶ Let  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a bounded sequence of real numbers and suppose  $|a_n| \leq M$ , for all  $n$ .
- ▶ Take  $c_1 = \inf\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}\} = \inf\{a_1, a_2, \dots\}$ ;

## Liminf

- ▶ Let  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a bounded sequence of real numbers and suppose  $|a_n| \leq M$ , for all  $n$ .
- ▶ Take  $c_1 = \inf\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}\} = \inf\{a_1, a_2, \dots\}$ ;
- ▶  $c_2 = \inf\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq 2\} = \inf\{a_2, a_3, \dots\}$ ;
- ▶  $c_3 = \inf\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq 3\} = \inf\{a_3, a_4, \dots\}$ ;

## Liminf

- ▶ Let  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a bounded sequence of real numbers and suppose  $|a_n| \leq M$ , for all  $n$ .
- ▶ Take  $c_1 = \inf\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}\} = \inf\{a_1, a_2, \dots\}$ ;
- ▶  $c_2 = \inf\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq 2\} = \inf\{a_2, a_3, \dots\}$ ;
- ▶  $c_3 = \inf\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq 3\} = \inf\{a_3, a_4, \dots\}$ ;
- ▶ and for any  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ ,

$$c_n = \inf\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq n\} = \inf\{a_n, a_{n+1}, \dots\}.$$

## Liminf

- ▶ Let  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a bounded sequence of real numbers and suppose  $|a_n| \leq M$ , for all  $n$ .
- ▶ Take  $c_1 = \inf\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}\} = \inf\{a_1, a_2, \dots\}$ ;
- ▶  $c_2 = \inf\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq 2\} = \inf\{a_2, a_3, \dots\}$ ;
- ▶  $c_3 = \inf\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq 3\} = \inf\{a_3, a_4, \dots\}$ ;
- ▶ and for any  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ ,

$$c_n = \inf\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq n\} = \inf\{a_n, a_{n+1}, \dots\}.$$

- ▶ Note that as  $\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}\} \supseteq \{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq 2\}$ , we have  $c_1 \leq c_2$ .

## Liminf

- ▶ Let  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a bounded sequence of real numbers and suppose  $|a_n| \leq M$ , for all  $n$ .
- ▶ Take  $c_1 = \inf\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}\} = \inf\{a_1, a_2, \dots\}$ ;
- ▶  $c_2 = \inf\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq 2\} = \inf\{a_2, a_3, \dots\}$ ;
- ▶  $c_3 = \inf\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq 3\} = \inf\{a_3, a_4, \dots\}$ ;
- ▶ and for any  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ ,

$$c_n = \inf\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq n\} = \inf\{a_n, a_{n+1}, \dots\}.$$

- ▶ Note that as  $\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}\} \supseteq \{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq 2\}$ , we have  $c_1 \leq c_2$ .
- ▶ In general,  $c_n \leq c_{n+1}$  for every  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ . We also have  $|c_n| \leq M$  for every  $n$ , as  $|a_m| \leq M$  for every  $m$ .

## Liminf

- ▶ Let  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a bounded sequence of real numbers and suppose  $|a_n| \leq M$ , for all  $n$ .
- ▶ Take  $c_1 = \inf\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}\} = \inf\{a_1, a_2, \dots\}$ ;
- ▶  $c_2 = \inf\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq 2\} = \inf\{a_2, a_3, \dots\}$ ;
- ▶  $c_3 = \inf\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq 3\} = \inf\{a_3, a_4, \dots\}$ ;
- ▶ and for any  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ ,

$$c_n = \inf\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq n\} = \inf\{a_n, a_{n+1}, \dots\}.$$

- ▶ Note that as  $\{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}\} \supseteq \{a_m : m \in \mathbb{N}, m \geq 2\}$ , we have  $c_1 \leq c_2$ .
- ▶ In general,  $c_n \leq c_{n+1}$  for every  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ . We also have  $|c_n| \leq M$  for every  $n$ , as  $|a_m| \leq M$  for every  $m$ .
- ▶ In conclusion,  $\{c_n\}$  is a bounded increasing sequence. Hence  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} c_n$  exists.

## Continuation

► **Definition 20.3:** For any bounded sequence  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ , the  $\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} c_n$  defined as above is known as the **limit inferior** or **liminf** of the bounded sequence  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ , and we write:

$$\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} c_n.$$

## Continuation

- ▶ **Definition 20.3:** For any bounded sequence  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ , the  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} c_n$  defined as above is known as the **limit inferior** or **liminf** of the bounded sequence  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ , and we write:

$$\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} c_n.$$

- ▶ In other words, the 'liminf' is the limit of infimums of tails of the sequence.

## Continuation

- ▶ **Definition 20.3:** For any bounded sequence  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ , the  $\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} c_n$  defined as above is known as the **limit inferior** or **liminf** of the bounded sequence  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ , and we write:

$$\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} c_n.$$

- ▶ In other words, the 'liminf' is the limit of infimums of tails of the sequence.
- ▶ Observe that for every  $n$ ,

$$-M \leq c_n \leq a_n \leq b_n \leq M.$$

## Continuation

- ▶ **Definition 20.3:** For any bounded sequence  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ , the  $\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} c_n$  defined as above is known as the **limit inferior** or **liminf** of the bounded sequence  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ , and we write:

$$\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} c_n.$$

- ▶ In other words, the 'liminf' is the limit of infimums of tails of the sequence.
- ▶ Observe that for every  $n$ ,

$$-M \leq c_n \leq a_n \leq b_n \leq M.$$

- ▶ Consequently,

$$-M \leq \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n \leq \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n \leq M.$$

## Continuation

- ▶ **Definition 20.3:** For any bounded sequence  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ , the  $\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} c_n$  defined as above is known as the **limit inferior** or **liminf** of the bounded sequence  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ , and we write:

$$\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} c_n.$$

- ▶ In other words, the 'liminf' is the limit of infimums of tails of the sequence.
- ▶ Observe that for every  $n$ ,

$$-M \leq c_n \leq a_n \leq b_n \leq M.$$

- ▶ Consequently,

$$-M \leq \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n \leq \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n \leq M.$$

- ▶ A bounded sequence may not be convergent and so it may not have a limit. But it always has liminf and limsup.

## Examples

► Example 20.4: Consider the sequence  $\{a_n\}$  where,

$$a_n = \begin{cases} 5 & \text{if } n = 3k + 1, k \in \mathbb{N} \cup \{0\} \\ 6 & \text{if } n = 3k + 2, k \in \mathbb{N} \cup \{0\} \\ 7 & \text{if } n = 3k, k \in \mathbb{N}. \end{cases}$$

## Examples

► Example 20.4: Consider the sequence  $\{a_n\}$  where,

$$a_n = \begin{cases} 5 & \text{if } n = 3k + 1, k \in \mathbb{N} \cup \{0\} \\ 6 & \text{if } n = 3k + 2, k \in \mathbb{N} \cup \{0\} \\ 7 & \text{if } n = 3k, k \in \mathbb{N}. \end{cases}$$

► Then  $b_n = 7$  for every  $n$  and  $c_n = 5$  for every  $n$ .

## Examples

► Example 20.4: Consider the sequence  $\{a_n\}$  where,

$$a_n = \begin{cases} 5 & \text{if } n = 3k + 1, k \in \mathbb{N} \cup \{0\} \\ 6 & \text{if } n = 3k + 2, k \in \mathbb{N} \cup \{0\} \\ 7 & \text{if } n = 3k, k \in \mathbb{N}. \end{cases}$$

► Then  $b_n = 7$  for every  $n$  and  $c_n = 5$  for every  $n$ .  
► Hence  $\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n = 5$  and  $\limsup a_n = 7$ .

## Examples

► Example 20.4: Consider the sequence  $\{a_n\}$  where,

$$a_n = \begin{cases} 5 & \text{if } n = 3k + 1, k \in \mathbb{N} \cup \{0\} \\ 6 & \text{if } n = 3k + 2, k \in \mathbb{N} \cup \{0\} \\ 7 & \text{if } n = 3k, k \in \mathbb{N}. \end{cases}$$

- Then  $b_n = 7$  for every  $n$  and  $c_n = 5$  for every  $n$ .
- Hence  $\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n = 5$  and  $\limsup a_n = 7$ .
- It is to be noted that in general  $b_n, c_n$  may not be terms of the sequence.

## Examples

► Example 20.4: Consider the sequence  $\{a_n\}$  where,

$$a_n = \begin{cases} 5 & \text{if } n = 3k + 1, k \in \mathbb{N} \cup \{0\} \\ 6 & \text{if } n = 3k + 2, k \in \mathbb{N} \cup \{0\} \\ 7 & \text{if } n = 3k, k \in \mathbb{N}. \end{cases}$$

- Then  $b_n = 7$  for every  $n$  and  $c_n = 5$  for every  $n$ .
- Hence  $\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n = 5$  and  $\limsup a_n = 7$ .
- It is to be noted that in general  $b_n, c_n$  may not be terms of the sequence.
- Example 20.5: Consider the sequence  $\{a_n\}$ , where

$$a_n = \begin{cases} \frac{1}{n} & \text{if } n \text{ is odd.} \\ 3 - \frac{1}{n} & \text{if } n \text{ is even.} \end{cases}$$

## Examples

► Example 20.4: Consider the sequence  $\{a_n\}$  where,

$$a_n = \begin{cases} 5 & \text{if } n = 3k + 1, k \in \mathbb{N} \cup \{0\} \\ 6 & \text{if } n = 3k + 2, k \in \mathbb{N} \cup \{0\} \\ 7 & \text{if } n = 3k, k \in \mathbb{N}. \end{cases}$$

- Then  $b_n = 7$  for every  $n$  and  $c_n = 5$  for every  $n$ .
- Hence  $\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n = 5$  and  $\limsup a_n = 7$ .
- It is to be noted that in general  $b_n, c_n$  may not be terms of the sequence.
- Example 20.5: Consider the sequence  $\{a_n\}$ , where

$$a_n = \begin{cases} \frac{1}{n} & \text{if } n \text{ is odd.} \\ 3 - \frac{1}{n} & \text{if } n \text{ is even.} \end{cases}$$

- Then  $b_n = 3$  for every  $n$  and  $c_n = 0$  for every  $n$ .

## Examples

► Example 20.4: Consider the sequence  $\{a_n\}$  where,

$$a_n = \begin{cases} 5 & \text{if } n = 3k + 1, k \in \mathbb{N} \cup \{0\} \\ 6 & \text{if } n = 3k + 2, k \in \mathbb{N} \cup \{0\} \\ 7 & \text{if } n = 3k, k \in \mathbb{N}. \end{cases}$$

- Then  $b_n = 7$  for every  $n$  and  $c_n = 5$  for every  $n$ .
- Hence  $\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n = 5$  and  $\limsup a_n = 7$ .
- It is to be noted that in general  $b_n, c_n$  may not be terms of the sequence.
- Example 20.5: Consider the sequence  $\{a_n\}$ , where

$$a_n = \begin{cases} \frac{1}{n} & \text{if } n \text{ is odd.} \\ 3 - \frac{1}{n} & \text{if } n \text{ is even.} \end{cases}$$

- Then  $b_n = 3$  for every  $n$  and  $c_n = 0$  for every  $n$ .
- In particular, it is not immediate that  $\limsup$  and  $\liminf$  are limit points of the sequence.

## A Characterization

► **Theorem 20.6:** Let  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a bounded sequence of real numbers and suppose  $z = \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n$ . Then for every  $\epsilon > 0$ , the set

$$S_+(z, \epsilon) = \{n : a_n > z + \epsilon\} \text{ is finite. } (*)$$

and the set

$$S_-(z, \epsilon) = \{n : a_n > z - \epsilon\} \text{ is infinite. } (**)$$

## A Characterization

► **Theorem 20.6:** Let  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a bounded sequence of real numbers and suppose  $z = \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n$ . Then for every  $\epsilon > 0$ , the set

$$S_+(z, \epsilon) = \{n : a_n > z + \epsilon\} \text{ is finite. } (*)$$

and the set

$$S_-(z, \epsilon) = \{n : a_n > z - \epsilon\} \text{ is infinite. } (**)$$

► Conversely if  $v \in \mathbb{R}$  satisfies  $(*)$ ,  $(**)$  for every  $\epsilon > 0$ , with  $z$  replaced by  $v$ , then  $v = z$ .

## A Characterization

► **Theorem 20.6:** Let  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a bounded sequence of real numbers and suppose  $z = \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n$ . Then for every  $\epsilon > 0$ , the set

$$S_+(z, \epsilon) = \{n : a_n > z + \epsilon\} \text{ is finite. } (*)$$

and the set

$$S_-(z, \epsilon) = \{n : a_n > z - \epsilon\} \text{ is infinite. } (**)$$

► Conversely if  $v \in \mathbb{R}$  satisfies  $(*)$ ,  $(**)$  for every  $\epsilon > 0$ , with  $z$  replaced by  $v$ , then  $v = z$ .

► **Proof:** Suppose  $z = \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n$ .

## A Characterization

► **Theorem 20.6:** Let  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a bounded sequence of real numbers and suppose  $z = \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n$ . Then for every  $\epsilon > 0$ , the set

$$S_+(z, \epsilon) = \{n : a_n > z + \epsilon\} \text{ is finite. } (*)$$

and the set

$$S_-(z, \epsilon) = \{n : a_n > z - \epsilon\} \text{ is infinite. } (**)$$

► Conversely if  $v \in \mathbb{R}$  satisfies  $(*)$ ,  $(**)$  for every  $\epsilon > 0$ , with  $z$  replaced by  $v$ , then  $v = z$ .

► **Proof:** Suppose  $z = \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n$ .

► Fix  $\epsilon > 0$ . Take  $b_n = \sup\{a_m : m \geq n\}$ . By the definition of limsup,  $z = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} b_n$ .

## A Characterization

- **Theorem 20.6:** Let  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a bounded sequence of real numbers and suppose  $z = \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n$ . Then for every  $\epsilon > 0$ , the set

$$S_+(z, \epsilon) = \{n : a_n > z + \epsilon\} \text{ is finite. } (*)$$

and the set

$$S_-(z, \epsilon) = \{n : a_n > z - \epsilon\} \text{ is infinite. } (**)$$

- Conversely if  $v \in \mathbb{R}$  satisfies  $(*)$ ,  $(**)$  for every  $\epsilon > 0$ , with  $z$  replaced by  $v$ , then  $v = z$ .
- **Proof:** Suppose  $z = \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n$ .
- Fix  $\epsilon > 0$ . Take  $b_n = \sup\{a_m : m \geq n\}$ . By the definition of  $\limsup$ ,  $z = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} b_n$ .
- Hence there exists  $K \in \mathbb{N}$  such that

$$b_n \in (z - \epsilon, z + \epsilon), \quad \forall n \geq K.$$

## Continuation

- ▶ In particular,  $b_K < z + \epsilon$ , or  $\sup\{a_m : m \geq K\} < z + \epsilon$ , and consequently  $a_m < z + \epsilon$  for  $m \geq K$ .

## Continuation

- ▶ In particular,  $b_K < z + \epsilon$ , or  $\sup\{a_m : m \geq K\} < z + \epsilon$ , and consequently  $a_m < z + \epsilon$  for  $m \geq K$ .
- ▶ This implies that  $S_+(z, \epsilon) \subseteq \{1, 2, \dots, (K - 1)\}$  and hence it is a finite set.

## Continuation

- ▶ In particular,  $b_K < z + \epsilon$ , or  $\sup\{a_m : m \geq K\} < z + \epsilon$ , and consequently  $a_m < z + \epsilon$  for  $m \geq K$ .
- ▶ This implies that  $S_+(z, \epsilon) \subseteq \{1, 2, \dots, (K-1)\}$  and hence it is a finite set.
- ▶ Now for  $r \in \mathbb{N}$ , by considering  $\frac{\epsilon}{r}$ , there exists  $K_r \in \mathbb{N}$  such that

$$b_n \in \left(z - \frac{\epsilon}{r}, z + \frac{\epsilon}{r}\right), \quad \forall n \geq K_r.$$

## Continuation

- ▶ In particular,  $b_K < z + \epsilon$ , or  $\sup\{a_m : m \geq K\} < z + \epsilon$ , and consequently  $a_m < z + \epsilon$  for  $m \geq K$ .
- ▶ This implies that  $S_+(z, \epsilon) \subseteq \{1, 2, \dots, (K-1)\}$  and hence it is a finite set.
- ▶ Now for  $r \in \mathbb{N}$ , by considering  $\frac{\epsilon}{r}$ , there exists  $K_r \in \mathbb{N}$  such that

$$b_n \in \left(z - \frac{\epsilon}{r}, z + \frac{\epsilon}{r}\right), \quad \forall n \geq K_r.$$

- ▶ In particular,  $z - \frac{\epsilon}{r} < b_{K_r} = \sup\{a_m : m \geq K_r\}$ .
- ▶ This means that, there exists  $m > K_r$ , such that  $z - \frac{\epsilon}{r} < b_m$ .

## Continuation

- ▶ In particular,  $b_K < z + \epsilon$ , or  $\sup\{a_m : m \geq K\} < z + \epsilon$ , and consequently  $a_m < z + \epsilon$  for  $m \geq K$ .
- ▶ This implies that  $S_+(z, \epsilon) \subseteq \{1, 2, \dots, (K-1)\}$  and hence it is a finite set.
- ▶ Now for  $r \in \mathbb{N}$ , by considering  $\frac{\epsilon}{r}$ , there exists  $K_r \in \mathbb{N}$  such that

$$b_n \in \left(z - \frac{\epsilon}{r}, z + \frac{\epsilon}{r}\right), \quad \forall n \geq K_r.$$

- ▶ In particular,  $z - \frac{\epsilon}{r} < b_{K_r} = \sup\{a_m : m \geq K_r\}$ .
- ▶ This means that, there exists  $m > K_r$ , such that  $z - \frac{\epsilon}{r} < b_m$ .
- ▶ Inductively we can choose  $m_1 < m_2 < \dots$  such that  $z - \frac{\epsilon}{r} < b_{m_r}$ .

## Continuation

- ▶ In particular,  $b_K < z + \epsilon$ , or  $\sup\{a_m : m \geq K\} < z + \epsilon$ , and consequently  $a_m < z + \epsilon$  for  $m \geq K$ .
- ▶ This implies that  $S_+(z, \epsilon) \subseteq \{1, 2, \dots, (K-1)\}$  and hence it is a finite set.
- ▶ Now for  $r \in \mathbb{N}$ , by considering  $\frac{\epsilon}{r}$ , there exists  $K_r \in \mathbb{N}$  such that

$$b_n \in \left(z - \frac{\epsilon}{r}, z + \frac{\epsilon}{r}\right), \quad \forall n \geq K_r.$$

- ▶ In particular,  $z - \frac{\epsilon}{r} < b_{K_r} = \sup\{a_m : m \geq K_r\}$ .
- ▶ This means that, there exists  $m > K_r$ , such that  $z - \frac{\epsilon}{r} < b_m$ .
- ▶ Inductively we can choose  $m_1 < m_2 < \dots$  such that  $z - \frac{\epsilon}{r} < b_{m_r}$ .
- ▶ Now it is clear that  $S_-(z, \epsilon)$  is infinite.

## Continuation

- ▶ Conversely, suppose  $v \in \mathbb{R}$  is such that  $(*)$  and  $(**)$  are satisfied for every  $\epsilon > 0$  with  $z$  replaced by  $v$ .

## Continuation

- ▶ Conversely, suppose  $v \in \mathbb{R}$  is such that  $(*)$  and  $(**)$  are satisfied for every  $\epsilon > 0$  with  $z$  replaced by  $v$ .
- ▶ Now  $S_+(v, \epsilon)$  is finite, means that there exists,  $M_\epsilon$ , such that for  $|a_n| \leq v + \epsilon$  for  $n \geq M_\epsilon$ .

## Continuation

- ▶ Conversely, suppose  $v \in \mathbb{R}$  is such that  $(*)$  and  $(**)$  are satisfied for every  $\epsilon > 0$  with  $z$  replaced by  $v$ .
- ▶ Now  $S_+(v, \epsilon)$  is finite, means that there exists,  $M_\epsilon$ , such that for  $|a_n| \leq v + \epsilon$  for  $n \geq M_\epsilon$ .
- ▶ Therefore  $b_n \leq v + \epsilon$  for  $n \geq M_\epsilon$ . Hence  $z = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} b_n \leq v + \epsilon$ .

## Continuation

- ▶ Conversely, suppose  $v \in \mathbb{R}$  is such that  $(*)$  and  $(**)$  are satisfied for every  $\epsilon > 0$  with  $z$  replaced by  $v$ .
- ▶ Now  $S_+(v, \epsilon)$  is finite, means that there exists,  $M_\epsilon$ , such that for  $|a_n| \leq v + \epsilon$  for  $n \geq M_\epsilon$ .
- ▶ Therefore  $b_n \leq v + \epsilon$  for  $n \geq M_\epsilon$ . Hence  $z = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} b_n \leq v + \epsilon$ .
- ▶ As this is true for every  $\epsilon > 0$ , we get  $z \leq v$ .

## Continuation

- ▶ Conversely, suppose  $v \in \mathbb{R}$  is such that  $(*)$  and  $(**)$  are satisfied for every  $\epsilon > 0$  with  $z$  replaced by  $v$ .
- ▶ Now  $S_+(v, \epsilon)$  is finite, means that there exists,  $M_\epsilon$ , such that for  $|a_n| \leq v + \epsilon$  for  $n \geq M_\epsilon$ .
- ▶ Therefore  $b_n \leq v + \epsilon$  for  $n \geq M_\epsilon$ . Hence  $z = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} b_n \leq v + \epsilon$ .
- ▶ As this is true for every  $\epsilon > 0$ , we get  $z \leq v$ .
- ▶ Similarly,  $S_-(v, \epsilon)$  is infinite, for every  $\epsilon > 0$ , means that  $S_-(v, \frac{1}{r}) = \{m : v - \frac{1}{r} < a_m\}$  is infinite for every  $r$ .

## Continuation

- ▶ Conversely, suppose  $v \in \mathbb{R}$  is such that  $(*)$  and  $(**)$  are satisfied for every  $\epsilon > 0$  with  $z$  replaced by  $v$ .
- ▶ Now  $S_+(v, \epsilon)$  is finite, means that there exists,  $M_\epsilon$ , such that for  $|a_n| \leq v + \epsilon$  for  $n \geq M_\epsilon$ .
- ▶ Therefore  $b_n \leq v + \epsilon$  for  $n \geq M_\epsilon$ . Hence  $z = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} b_n \leq v + \epsilon$ .
- ▶ As this is true for every  $\epsilon > 0$ , we get  $z \leq v$ .
- ▶ Similarly,  $S_-(v, \epsilon)$  is infinite, for every  $\epsilon > 0$ , means that  $S_-(v, \frac{1}{r}) = \{m : v - \frac{1}{r} < a_m\}$  is infinite for every  $r$ .
- ▶ This allows us to choose a subsequence  $\{a_{n_r}\}_{r \in \mathbb{N}}$ , where  $v - \frac{1}{r} < a_{n_r}$ . Then  $v - \frac{1}{r} < b_{n_r}$ , and hence on taking limit as  $r \rightarrow \infty$ ,  $v \leq \lim_{r \rightarrow \infty} b_{n_r} = z$ . That is,  $v \leq z$ . Combining the two statements we have  $v = z$ .

## limsup as a limit point

- Theorem 20.7: Suppose  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  is a bounded sequence of real numbers. Then  $\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n$  is a limit point of  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  and if  $y$  is any limit point of  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ , then  $y \leq \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n$ .

## limsup as a limit point

- ▶ **Theorem 20.7:** Suppose  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  is a bounded sequence of real numbers. Then  $\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n$  is a limit point of  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  and if  $y$  is any limit point of  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ , then  $y \leq \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n$ .
- ▶ In other words, limsup is the largest limit point of a bounded sequence.

## limsup as a limit point

- ▶ **Theorem 20.7:** Suppose  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  is a bounded sequence of real numbers. Then  $\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n$  is a limit point of  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  and if  $y$  is any limit point of  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ , then  $y \leq \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n$ .
- ▶ In other words, limsup is the largest limit point of a bounded sequence.
- ▶ **Proof:** Take  $z = \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n$ .

## limsup as a limit point

- ▶ **Theorem 20.7:** Suppose  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  is a bounded sequence of real numbers. Then  $\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n$  is a limit point of  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  and if  $y$  is any limit point of  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ , then  $y \leq \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n$ .
- ▶ In other words, limsup is the largest limit point of a bounded sequence.
- ▶ **Proof:** Take  $z = \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n$ .
- ▶ By the previous characterization,  $\{m : z - \epsilon < a_m < z + \epsilon\} = S_-(z, \epsilon) \setminus (S_+(z, \epsilon) \cup \{z + \epsilon\})$  is infinite.

## limsup as a limit point

- ▶ **Theorem 20.7:** Suppose  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  is a bounded sequence of real numbers. Then  $\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n$  is a limit point of  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  and if  $y$  is any limit point of  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ , then  $y \leq \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n$ .
- ▶ In other words, limsup is the largest limit point of a bounded sequence.
- ▶ **Proof:** Take  $z = \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n$ .
- ▶ By the previous characterization,  $\{m : z - \epsilon < a_m < z + \epsilon\} = S_-(z, \epsilon) \setminus (S_+(z, \epsilon) \cup \{z + \epsilon\})$  is infinite.
- ▶ Hence  $z$  is a limit point of  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ .

## limsup as a limit point

- ▶ **Theorem 20.7:** Suppose  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  is a bounded sequence of real numbers. Then  $\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n$  is a limit point of  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  and if  $y$  is any limit point of  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ , then  $y \leq \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n$ .
- ▶ In other words, limsup is the largest limit point of a bounded sequence.
- ▶ **Proof:** Take  $z = \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n$ .
- ▶ By the previous characterization,  $\{m : z - \epsilon < a_m < z + \epsilon\} = S_-(z, \epsilon) \setminus (S_+(z, \epsilon) \cup \{z + \epsilon\})$  is infinite.
- ▶ Hence  $z$  is a limit point of  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ .
- ▶ The fact that  $z$  is the largest limit point is also clear from the characterization.

## limsup as a limit point

- ▶ **Theorem 20.7:** Suppose  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  is a bounded sequence of real numbers. Then  $\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n$  is a limit point of  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  and if  $y$  is any limit point of  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ , then  $y \leq \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n$ .
- ▶ In other words, limsup is the largest limit point of a bounded sequence.
- ▶ **Proof:** Take  $z = \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} a_n$ .
- ▶ By the previous characterization,  $\{m : z - \epsilon < a_m < z + \epsilon\} = S_-(z, \epsilon) \setminus (S_+(z, \epsilon) \cup \{z + \epsilon\})$  is infinite.
- ▶ Hence  $z$  is a limit point of  $\{a_n\}_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ .
- ▶ The fact that  $z$  is the largest limit point is also clear from the characterization.
- ▶ **END OF LECTURE 20**